SBA Lending Equity and Efficiency Challenges

by

Derek Hyra and Meghan Dought

Metropolitan Policy Center School of Public Affairs American University

White Paper Commissioned **by**eNational Association of GovernmenGuaranteedLenders

December 23, 2014

!

Introduction

AmericaÕs small businessesianaportant drivers ofhenationaleconomy anabor creation Small firms employ half of the UniteStrates(U.S.) labor force and sice 1995 small businesses have provided approximately 65 percenthet new jobs the American economy. Moreover, since the Great Recession small business avecontributed to a significant proportion of American job recovery (Mills and McCarthy 2014).

precipitousdecline inSBA loan

! \$

!

larger SBA loans 5. Consequently, ince 2007 the SBA 7(a) loan profile ${\it ftbrese}$ smaller dollar loans decrease ${\it b}$ y 68 percent

%

will be denied (Bates and Rob2014). This is especially true among firms headin minority neighborhoods. Table 1 displays difference in the percent of soliouraged for rowers in high minority (24.5 percent) tversus lowminority (17.3 percent) neighborhoods. These cumulating factors, in addition to the persistent and growing wealth, income and credit score racial disparities, likely explain the decreasing schaff SBA loans to African American (MBDA, 2010).

Table 1. Credit Needs and LoApplication Outcomes for Urban Firm (annual rates)

	(ariiluai raics)	
	Minority Neighborhood Firms	White Neighborhood Firms
All Small Firms		
% Discouraged Firms	24.5	17.3
Applicant Firms Only		
% Always Approved	56.7	62.0
% Always Denied	27.3	20.4

A version ofthis tablewasdisplayed in lates and Rob(2014)

Black, Hispanic and Whitewned firms. Thus, stimulating minority loan demandand deploying more loans to these firms that not be good usines practice for lender or the SBA.

However, small business investments ould perhaps less precarious if minority small businesses are located inerging market areas. For instance, strategic small business investments in minority communities girig aggregate income (Alwitt and Donlet) 997) and experiencing escalating real estate values (Meltzer and Sc2062) might be less risky. Certain stable, existing mall businesses that understand how to tap into a revitalizing community os existing and anging demographics and preferences might be well suited for investment, growth and expansition in press. Further, evidence suggests that credit score

Borrower Education

Additionally, the SBA shouldtarget small busizesslending education effors, particularly in the use of the 50 program to purchase real estated merging market zones likely experience increasing property values lacebased argeted education efforts, through SBA District Offices, SCORE trapters, Small Busines evelopment Centers of omen Busines Centers and Certified Development Companies gight help both new and longstand immignority owned businesses benefit from the expanding 7(a) and 504 loan volume.

Strategic Partnerships

The SBA should stabilish strategic partnership with certain lenders to stimulate lending black owned businesses emerging market area are a market area are a market area and historically black owned ball beat owned ball and 2014,

in recent studies have been defined as either greater per capital incontigher employment rate.

Below is a review ofive selected studies since 2007 thantivestigated the relationship between SBA lending and indicators of total economic growth these studies use different tasamples and economic modes to testwhether SBA lending increases or decreases indicators of an area os economic performance Taken as whole results are mixed among these studies suggest that SBA lending is positively associated with call economic growth and employment, while other point to negative association selow is a review of these studies in chronology between

Early Studies Positive Effects

In 2007Craig, Jacksoand Thomson(2007a) investigated if SBA lendinghad a discernable impact on metropolitan economic growth. In their stubby A lending was defined as the tal dollar amount of SBA loans called by total deposits in the market lagger one year. The

Craig, Jackson and Thomsofollowed up on their 2007 study with another in 2008 ptest whether metrolevel income moderates the relationship they found ween SBA lending and employment rate Using OLS, fixed effects models they find that per capital SBA lending (from 1991 to 2001) was only significantly related to incertain ployment levels in lowncome areas. Their research suggests that SBA lending the only positively influence employment levels in low-income areas.

Together these threestudies lead by Craigsuggest a couple of important points. Figsteater SBA lendingin an MSA

counties. They also use period and statefixed effect models, have positreat Receisan period data and incorporate variables into their model previous research has rank as an interest rate differential variable.

It is quite possible that the integrative relationship finding tween SBA lending and per capita income is related to the economic crisis. If more SBA loans were made in the places hit hardest by the crisisthis might explain the difference between their finding scall of the oher studies. Another possibility might be their assumption of spatial dependency as well incorporation of their interest rate differential variable It is perhaps theoretical stretch to assume that BBA lending in one county affects income growth in a nearby found her, the justification for their interest rate differential variable unclear. Thus, their results might, in part, stem from inappropriate theoretical assumption as well massed misspecification which can lead to incorrect results While the fivereviewed studies each have merits and limits, taken as a whole is clear that the results concerning the pact of SBA lending on local conomic conditionare inconclusive

Further Research

Further research needs to be conducted to better understand effective ways tequeld used efficiency concerns related to the cosBA guaranteed lending programs. While a planteed emerging market proposal was made in this white papernewed more information to better understand this approach will lead to sound, satisdequitablelending. Furthermore, the relationship between SBA lending and ocal economic conditions needs be further studied. Below are four questions, if answered with sound research fronts.

What effects does SBA lending have on employment and income in low- and moderate-income communities?

There have been several studies that investigate the relationship between SBA lending and indicators of economic growth at the cotynandMSA levels, but little researchif any, has examined he impact of SBA lending ormaller geographies, such as a community, neighborhood or census tractwould be informative to investigate whether capitaSBA lending controlling for other factors, in lowand moderate ncome communities, or census tracts, is associated with employment rates and income levels. Having this information might add to, refine anotherity the effects of SBA lending neconomic indicator at distinct geographic levels.

In what ways do SBA lending programs contribute to neighborhood redevelopment?

Several studies have investigated community development outcomes related to government programs such as the community development block græster, Tatian and Accordino 2006) and HOPE VI housing grantælielenbach2003) but few have investigated relationship between 7(a)nd 504investments and property values near the firms that receive these loans. An investigation that isolated the effects of SBA lending on nearby property values could help to dearly articulae the impact of these rograms.

Are 7(a) and 504 default rates lower in redeveloping minority neighborhoods vs. non-redeveloping minority areas?

We know that defaults rates varly agracial and ethnic lines at the individual and neighboth levels. But a key question is whether redeveloping minority areas are less risky than, similarly situated, norredeveloping minority areas. If redeveloping minority areas have lower default rates, it would make policy sense to create a place of emeging market program.

Do SBA loans advance or "crowd out" the conventional small business lending market in lowand moderate-income communities?

LeeÕs study suggests that SBA loans ÒcrottÓdconventional loan While it is plausible for this to occur credit worthy areas, does the promise and moderate come areas? It seems if we are interested in equity and efficiency concerns portant study would be to testwhether SBA lending in lowered moderate communities advancer Òcrowd outÓ conventional busines to answer to this question would help policy makers better understand whether the SBA programs are efficient in hour areas.

Conclusion

Small businesses are a vital part of the American economy. They provide a the employment opportunities in our country. Yet, they pose a challenge for lending institutions because it can be difficult to determine their ability to repay loans. The SBA loan guaranteed programs were designed to support small busines in particularly during economic downturns and low growth periods. As Ameridaes slowly recovered from the Great Recession, the SBAOs 7(a) and 504 programs have

Works Cited

- Alwitt, L., and Donley, T. (1997). Retail Stores Poor Urban Neighborhood *Econsumer Affairs*, 139-164.
- Bates, T.and Robb, A(2014). Hashe Community Reinvestment Act Increased Loan Availability Among Small Businesses Operating in Minority ighbourhoods *Urban Studies*, 1-20.
- _____.(2008). Analysis of Young Neighborhood Firms Serving Urban Minority Cs. Journal of Economics and Business, 139-148.

Office of the Advocate. (2014). Frequently Asked Questions about Small Business. Washington, DC: Small Business Administration.

Rugh, J., and Massey, D. (2010). Racial Segregation And The American Foreclosure Crisis. American Sociological Review, 629-651.

Simon, R. (2014, March 14). Loan Rebound Missed Black Businesses; Fewer SBA

!